



CITY OF PLAINFIELD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, ROOM 202
 PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY 07060



Sharon Robinson-Briggs, Mayor

Sandra Gurshman, Chairwoman
 John Favazzo, Vice Chairman

Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission Reorganization & Regular Meeting Minutes
January 22, 2013, 7:30 PM, City Hall Library, 515 Watchung Avenue, Plainfield, New Jersey

Name, Class Designation (Term Duration)	1/22/13	2/26/13	3/19/13	4/23/13	5/28/13	6/25/13	7/23/13	8/27/13	9/24/13	10/22/13	11/19/13	12/17/13
Vice Chairman John Favazzo, Class A (5/10/10 - 12/31/13)	X											
Lawrence Ferrara, Class C (1/18/11 - 12/31/14)	X											
James Galvin, Alternate #1, Class A (1/3/13 - 12/31/14)	X											
Bill Garrett, Class B (2/3/12 - 12/31/15)	X											
Chairwoman Sandra Gurshman, Class B (1/18/11 - 12/31/14)	X											
Jan Jasper, Class C (1/3/13 - 12/31/16)	X											
Patricia Turner Kavanaugh, Class C (1/3/12 - 12/31/15)	X											
Elizabeth King, Class C (1/3/13 - 12/31/16)	X											
William Michelson, Class B (1/18/11 - 12/31/14)	X											
David Westlake, Class A (1/3/13 - 12/31/16)	X											
Alternate Member #2 VACANT (2-year term)												
HPC Consultant Gail Hunton												
HPC Secretary Scott Bauman	X											

Call to Order and Public Notice for Reorganization Meeting

Historic Preservation Commission Secretary Scott Bauman called the reorganization meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:33 PM and read the following into the record: *“This is the reorganization meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Plainfield, Union County, New Jersey. Adequate notice of this meeting has been given in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act in that a notice was published in the Courier News on January 4, 2013, and the notice of this meeting was posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices.”*

2013 Reorganization of the Historic Preservation Commission

- Nomination and Election of Chairperson for 2013: Ms. Jasper made a motion to nominate Ms. Gurshman, Ms. King seconded the motion. There were no other nominations. All voted in favor, none opposed. Mr. Bauman turned the meeting over to Chairwoman Gurshman who thanked everyone for their confidence and called for nominations for the election of a vice chairperson.
- Nomination and Election of Vice-Chairperson for 2013: Mr. Westlake made a motion to nominate Mr. Michelson; no one seconded the motion. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to nominate Mr. Favazzo; Ms. King seconded the motion. There were no other nominations. All voted in favor, none opposed. Vice Chairman Favazzo thanked the Commission. Chairwoman Gurshman thanked Mr. Michelson for serving as Vice Chairman for 2011 and 2012. Mr. Michelson thanked the Commission.

3. Appointment of Historic Preservation Consultant for 2013: Ms. Jasper made a motion to appoint Gail Hunton; Mr. Garrett seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations. All voted in favor, none opposed.
4. Appointment of Historic Preservation Commission Secretary for 2013: Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to appoint Scott Bauman; Ms. Jasper seconded the nomination. There were no other nominations. All voted in favor, none opposed.
5. Resolution Designating of Official Newspaper: Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to designate the Courier News as the official newspaper for the publication of official notices and as the official newspaper to receive notices for the purpose of the Open Public Meetings Act. Ms. King seconded the motion; all voted in favor, none opposed.
6. Resolution Adopting Procedures, Forms, and By Laws: Mr. Galvin made a motion to adopt the procedures, forms, and by-laws for 2013 as cited in Article IV of the City Land Use Ordinance adopted by City Council December 2, 2002, amended through August 8, 2011. Vice Chairman Michelson seconded the motion. All voted in favor, none opposed.
7. Adoption of the 2013 Meeting Schedule: Ms. King made a motion to adopt the 2013 meeting schedule, including the January 28, 2014, reorganization meeting. The Commission shall meet on the 4th Tuesday of each month with exception to March, November, and December at which time the Commission will meet on the 3rd Tuesday. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh seconded the motion. All voted in favor, none opposed.

Adjournment of Reorganization Meeting

There being no further business, Mr. Michelson made a motion to adjourn the reorganization meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Galvin. All voted in favor, none opposed. The reorganization meeting adjourned at 7:43 PM

Call to Order and Public Notice for Regular Meeting

Chairwoman Gurshman called the regular meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:43 PM and read the following into the record: *"This is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Plainfield, Union County, New Jersey. Adequate notice of this meeting has been given in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act in that a notice was published in the Courier News on January 4, 2013, and the notice of this meeting was posted in the City Clerk and Planning Division offices."*

Adoption of December 18, 2012, Meeting Minutes

Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to approve the December 18, 2012, meeting minutes as presented. Mr. Michelson seconded the motion and the meeting minutes were approved unanimously by voice vote. Ms. Jasper and Mr. Garrett abstained from voting.

Unfinished Business

1. Carried Certificate of Appropriateness: HPC 12-16: 240 East Ninth Street; Block 842, Lot 27 Crescent Area Historic District / Applicant and Owner: Benito Diaz

The Applicant, Benito Diaz, of 750 Westminster Avenue, Elizabeth, NJ, is requesting after-the-fact approval for the installation of stone tile over the cement front porch steps, and columns. The Applicant is also seeking approval to tint grey the concrete porch floor and concrete walkway which lies between the porch and public sidewalk in the front yard area. The first hearing was held on December 18, 2012; the Applicant has returned with Marina Tupaz of 750 Westminister Avenue, Elizabeth, NJ to assist with his presentation.

At the first hearing the Commission heard the Applicant's proposal for driveway and rear yard parking lot improvements; at the hearing it was discovered that the Commission did not have jurisdiction over the parking lot improvements since there may be variances involved. The Commission voted to carry the application to the January 22, 2013, meeting to give the Applicant time to provide the Commission with a tile sample.

Ms. Tupaz said that Mr. Diaz will do whatever is suggested by the Commission. Chairwoman asked if any Commission members had questions or comments. Mr. Westlake said he visited the site and he believes that the tile is made of artificial stone which is not suitable for exterior use and not appropriate for the house. The tiles that were

installed on the bottom of the columns will accelerate the decay of the columns. Mr. Westlake recommended removing the tiles and repairing the concrete. Mr. Westlake commented that he felt that the porch is original to the house; the scored concrete can be smoothed out.

Mr. Michelson said a stucco finish over the concrete would be more suitable than tile; he doesn't like the tile or its color- too light and bright. Ms. Jasper cited safety concerns resulting in the tile being slippery in the event of rain, snow, or ice. Chairwoman Gurshman added that the possibility exists of the tiles being broken up during snow / ice removal, and that going back to concrete is the best solution. Vice Chairman Favazzo said depending on the depth of the scoring, grinding and polishing the concrete may remove it. The Applicant agreed to grey tint the concrete walkway between the porch and public sidewalk in the front yard area.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. Brian Munroe of 313 Franklin Place said there is a house that is located 2 buildings to the left of 240 East Ninth Street that has regular concrete stairs that goes to a concrete floor entranceway- this style is not too uncommon in the Crescent Area Historic District.

There being no further comments from the public, Chairwoman Gurshman closed the public comment portion meeting. After further discussion, Ms. King made a motion to deny the proposal and make the Applicant remove the tiles, repair the existing concrete, and grey tint the concrete walkway and concrete porch floor. Ms. Jasper seconded the motion. Vice Chairman Favazzo recommended that the motion be amended to say that the work shall be done by someone who has experience with concrete; Mr. Galvin further requested that the motion be amended to read that the concrete shall be repaired and restored to its original condition. Ms. King was satisfied with the amendments presented and agreed to amend her motion. Ms. Jasper seconded the amended motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

New Business

1. Certificate of Appropriateness: HPC 12-23: 835 Field Avenue; Block 760, Lot 22

Van Wyck Brooks Historic District / Applicant and Owner: David Cress

Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the Applicants adequately served notice and the Commission has jurisdiction to hear the application. Tamara Cress and David Cress of 835 Field Avenue introduced themselves to the Commission. Ms. Cress told those present that her and her husband propose to install a 6' high wooden fence / gate across the driveway, and a 6' high vinyl fence in the rear yard that that cannot be seen from the street.

Ms. Cress provided the Commission with a picture of the front of the house. The wood fence will be redwood; the vinyl fence will be Home Depot Pro Series Dover Privacy fence Model 141569. Ms. Cress said the surrounding neighbor's fences in the back yard which abut to their property all have 6' high vinyl fences; the proposed vinyl fence will match what already exists. Mr. Cress added that the cost and maintenance of a vinyl fence is less than that of a wooden fence.

Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. No one from the public commented. Chairwoman Gurshman closed the public comment portion meeting. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion to approve the proposal as submitted. Ms. King seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

2. Zoning Board Referral: ZB 12-31: 815 Field Avenue; Block 760, Lot 25

Van Wyck Brooks Historic District / Applicant and Owner: Daniel Cone

Mr. Westlake recused himself from the hearing since he is representing the Applicant / property owner Mr. Daniel Cone who was not present. Mr. Westlake of 1018 East Seventh Street is an architect licensed in the State of New Jersey and introduced himself to the Commission as Mr. Cone's representative.

Mr. Westlake said the proposal to construct an addition to the single family home requires relief from zone requirements, specifically side yard, combined side yard, building coverage, lot coverage requirements. The structure is a 1953 contemporary split level and is not a contributing structure in the Van Wyck Brooks Historic District, and the proposed addition is not visible from the public right-of-way. The addition consists of expanding the kitchen and dining room.

Chairwoman Gurshman added if there were no zoning implications, the Commission would not be hearing this at all since the proposed addition cannot be seen from the public right-of-way. Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. No one from the public commented. Chairwoman Gurshman closed the public comment portion meeting. Mr. Michelson made a motion to inform the Zoning Board of Adjustment that the Historic Preservation Commission has no objection to the proposed addition. Mr. Ferrara seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

3. Informal Hearing: HPC 12-19: 161-167 Crescent Avenue; Block 832, Lot 7

Crescent Area Historic District / Applicant: Luis Windows /Owner: 165 Crescent Avenue, LLC

Mr. Habib Khan of 6 Big Ramapo Road, Saddle River introduced himself as a representative of the property owner 165 Crescent Avenue, LLC. Mr. Luis Mancada of 1463 Frances Lane, Plainfield introduced himself as the contractor hired by the Applicant to perform the window installation.

On October 27, 2012, Zoning Officer William Nierstedt received a phone call informing him that 4 over 4 wood frame windows were being removed at the above-cited address and 1 over 1 vinyl windows were being installed. While window replacement that does not increase or decrease the aperture does not require a building permit, it does however require a Certificate of Appropriateness. Mr. Nierstedt told Mr. Mancada via telephone to stop removing the wood windows and retain the already removed wood windows on site. Mr. Mancada stopped work and subsequently submitted an application for Certificate of Appropriateness on November, 8, 2012. The submission was deemed incomplete on November 9, and December 13, 2012. On January 15, 2012, the Commission's Architectural Review Committee met with Mr. Khan on site to discuss his application; at that time Mr. Khan expressed a desire to meet with the Commission for an informal hearing.

Mr. Khan told the Commission that he acquired the property- an 18 unit apartment building- in July, 2011 via auction; he was not aware at the time that the property was in a historic district. Mr. Khan told the Commission that his tenants complained about the windows having drafts and not energy efficient. The building has 198 windows and 138 windows were already changed when work was stopped.

Vice Chairman Favazzo said the Commission doesn't allow vinyl windows. Mr. Khan informed the Commission that contradictory to what was initially submitted by Mr. Mancada, the windows do not have lead paint- that is not the reason for replacing the windows. Chairwoman Gurshman asked Mr. Khan to describe the two proposal he submitted to the Commission. Mr. Mancada said one estimate is from Lowes Home Improvement for Pella aluminum clad wood frame windows in the amount of \$95,465.67; the second estimate is from Huston Lumber for Jeld-Wen wood windows in the amount of \$130,628.49. Both estimates include labor, tax, and disposal costs.

Vice Chairman Favazzo asked Mr. Khan to consider moving the already installed vinyl windows to the rear of the structure and install wood frame windows in the front- all of the windows are the same size. It was noted that the building is located on a corner property and due to its height nearly all of the windows on all 4 elevations can be seen from the public right-of-way. Mr. Galvin said the Commission has never approved vinyl windows. When asked if the already purchased windows can be returned, Mr. Kahn replied that the windows were custom made and cannot be returned. Ms. Turner Kavanaugh said she could not vote to approve vinyl windows; Mr. Michelson said neither could he. Mr. Westlake said that where the vinyl windows were installed, the original wood window sills are still in place- the contractor covered the wood sills with aluminum coil stock- he would like to see that removed. Mr. Westlake also cited concern over how the wood scalloped tops and panel bottoms would be treated if new vinyl windows were installed in those locations.

Chairwoman Gurshman informed the Applicant that the Commission was not going to act on this tonight; the next two meetings are February 26, and March 19. Chairwoman Gurshman opened the meeting to the public. Brian Munroe of 313 Franklin Place said you can see all sides of the building due to its size and height. Mr. Munroe said he was present when the Zoning Officer told the contractor to stop work- it was Mr. Munroe's cell phone that was communicating the message. Mr. Munroe told the Commission that the Zoning Officer told the contractor to keep the old windows and not to throw them away. When asked about this, Mr. Mancada said he removed the windows from the site and disposed them.

Chairwoman Gurshman closed the public comment portion meeting; she informed the Applicant that he needs to appear before the Commission for a public hearing on either February 26, or March 19; if not the Zoning Officer will issue violation notices. Messrs. Khan and Mancada thanked the Commission for their time.

Staff Report

1. Volunteer designations for Committees for 2013
 - A. Architectural Review / Minor Application Review Committee: David Westlake, Pat Turner Kavanaugh, Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman. Alternate Bill Garrett
 - B. Ordinance Revision Committee: Bill Michelson, Jim Galvin, Chairwoman Sandy Gurshman
 - C. Community Outreach / Awareness Committee: Jan Jasper, Elizabeth King, Vice Chairman John Favazzo. Alternate Pat Turner Kavanaugh
2. Community Outreach / Historic Preservation Awareness
 - A. Postcard Notifying Owners in Historic Districts / Locally Designated Historic Sites
 - The postcard is finalized and will be submitted to the Planning Division for final remarks and “sign off”
 - B. Sleepy Hollow Realtors Newsletter Insert
 - The insert needs to be finalized within a week in order to make the publication deadline. Mr. Bauman will work with Chairwoman Gurshman and Ms. Turner Kavanaugh to ensure that the deadline is met.
 - C. Revisions to City’s Certificate of Compliance to Reflect Historic District / Landmark Status
 - Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the city will soon revise the Certificate of Compliance.
3. Replacement of Green Brook Park Pedestrian Bridge- Green Brook Park Historic District
 - **Background:** In June and October, the City informed Union County and the SHPO that Planning Board review and Historic Preservation Commission review is required for this project. In November, the County’s consulting engineer Neglia Associates sent plans to Langan Engineering- the City’s consulting engineer- to coordinate the bridge design with the NJDEP design standards for the Green Brook Walkway. Langan Engineering reviewed the plan and provided comments in December, 2012.
 - **Update:** Ms. Hunton spoke to Union County (Paul Leso) about Langan’s comments. The discussion focused on a wooden footbridge on sheet 29.02; the design does not meet AASHTO requirements and the County cited concerns over the durability and maintenance of timber bridges. Ms. Hunton agreed to prepare a letter for Union County citing the durability of timber bridges.
4. 2013 Certified Local Government No Match Grant
 - After discussion, the Commission agreed that the best proposal to submit to the State Historic Preservation Office is the Spanish translation of the City’s Design Guidelines. Ms. Hunton and Mr. Bauman agreed to work on this project- the submission deadline to the State Historic Preservation Office is March 1, 2013.
5. Properties in Historic Districts / Historic Sites with Code / Maintenance Violations
 - Mr. Bauman referred Commission members to his staff report which lists the properties of interest to the Commission.
6. Replacement of Pemberton Avenue Culvert PL-75: Cedar Brook Park Historic District
 - **Background:** Ms. Hunton heard from the State Historic Preservation Office that Union County’s consulting engineer agreed to make revisions to the culvert design- these revised plans have not yet been received by the City or the State Historic Preservation Office. Mr. Bauman will follow up with the County.
 - **Update:** The City and County are discussing the possibility of sharing the cost of the new culvert design by further sharing the costs associated with non-related roadway paving projects.

Discussion

No discussion items.

Adjournment of Regular Meeting

There being no further business, Ms. Turner Kavanaugh made a motion for adjournment, seconded by Mr. Westlake, all voted in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 9:35 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Scott Bauman

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP

Principal Planner / HPC Secretary, Plainfield Planning Division

Prepared: February 15, 2013

HPC Approved: February 26, 2013