



CITY OF PLAINFIELD
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, ROOM 202
 PLAINFIELD, NEW JERSEY 07060



William H. Michelson, Chairman
Lawrence T. Quirk, Vice Chairman

Adrian O. Mapp, Mayor

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
SEPTEMBER 27, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

Call to Order and Public Notice

Chairman William Michelson called the regular meeting of the Plainfield Historic Preservation Commission to order at 7:34 P.M. and in conformance with the Open Public Meetings Act read aloud the following: "In compliance with the Open Public Meetings Act, this is a regularly scheduled meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Plainfield. Adequate notice of this meeting was given in accordance with the Open Public Meetings Act, the annual meeting schedule was published in the Courier-News on January 30, 2016, and copies of the meeting schedule are posted in the offices of the City Clerk and Planning Division. I ask that everyone including Commission members please turn their cell phones to silence or vibrate and not take or send any electronic messages during this meeting."

Roll Call

2016 Historic Preservation Commission Name, Class Designation (Term Ends)	1/26/16	2/23/16 (cancelled)	3/22/16	4/26/16	5/24/16	6/28/16	7/26/16	8/23/16 (cancelled)	9/27/16	10/25/16	11/15/16	12/20/16
John Favazzo, Class A (12/31/2017)	X		X	X	X	X	X		X			
Bill Garrett, Class B (12/31/2019)		C	X	X	X	X	X		X			
Sandra Gurshman, Class B (12/31/2018)	X	A	X	X	X	X	X		X			
Jan Jasper, Class C (12/31/2016)	X	N					X					
Elizabeth King, Class C (12/31/2016)	X	C		X	X	X	X		X			
William Michelson, Class B (12/31/2018)	X	E	X	X	X	X	X		X			
Lawrence Quirk Class A (12/31/2017)	X	L	X	X		X	X		X			
Gary Schneider, Class C (12/31/2019)		L	X	X	X	X	X		X			
Reginald Thomas, Class A (12/31/2018)		E	X		X	X	X		X			
Alternate Member #1 VACANT (2 year term)		D										
Alternate Member #2 VACANT (2 year term)												

Also present: HPC Consultant Barton Ross, and HPC Secretary Scott Bauman

Presentation of June 28, 2016, Meeting Minutes

Ms. King made a motion to approve the June 28, 2016, meeting minutes as presented; Mr. Garrett seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

Presentation of July 26, 2016, Meeting Minutes

Ms. King made a motion to approve the June 28, 2016, meeting minutes as presented; Ms. Gurshman seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
SEPTEMBER 27, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business

1. Discussion: Plainfield Engine Station 4. 1015 South Avenue. Block 645, Lot 7

Fire Chief Frank Tidwell, Captain Walter Thompson, and Lieutenant John Reed of the Plainfield Fire Division, 315 Central Avenue, Plainfield, introduced themselves to the Historic Preservation Commission. Captain Tidwell thanked the Commission for their volunteerism in keeping Plainfield historic.

Chief Tidwell informed the Commission that the Plainfield Fire Division proposes to widen the left side apparatus opening by twelve (12) inches and install two (2) new replacement garage doors. The subject property was listed on the State and National Registers of Historic Places in 1993. Commissioner John Favazzo entered the meeting room at 7:39 PM.

Chief Tidwell said earlier this year that the Plainfield City Council approved the purchase of a new firefighting apparatus that is being delivered in November, and the left side bay door needs to be widened to fit the apparatus into the building. When asked why the Fire Division ordered an engine truck that does not fit the building, Chief Tidwell replied that the bay is narrow to begin with, and the apparatus on order is a multi-task pumper that is large but needed by the city.

Lt. Reed provided the Commission with historic pictures of the building and pictures of the building as it is today. Lt. Reed also distributed a specification sheet for the bay doors. Lt. Reed informed the Commission that the existing bay opening is 9'-10" and the apparatus is 9'-5". By opening the bay by 6 inches on each side, the new apparatus will have over 12 inches of clearance on each side. When asked why not expand both bay openings, Lt. Reed explained that the length of the right side bay is shorter than the left side and cannot accommodate the apparatus that requires a wider opening.

Lt. Reed described the proposed replacement doors to the Commission. The doors are made of lightweight polystyrene, and will have four windows each instead of three like the existing doors. Having more windows allows more light to enter the building but the Fire Division is open to reducing the windows from four to three. The doors will be powder coated red. When asked why the doors are constructed of polystyrene, Lt. Reed said it makes the doors lighter- the doors open and close at least thirty times a day and the lighter the load, the longer the mechanisms will last.

Chairman Michelson commented that the proposal will result in losing the symmetry of the building; Mr. Favazzo added that the proposed garage widening does not align with the second floor windows. If both doorways were being widened it would be a "no-brainer." Chairman Michelson asked if this project is addressed in the city's Capital Improvement Plan; Lt. Reed said that the funding is coming from the operating budget due to timing. When asked about widening the door on the right side, Chief Tidwell said that there are structural columns and water/heat pipes running through the center and they cannot be cut. Chief Tidwell stressed the importance of having a firehouse to accommodate the new engine.

Chairman Michelson informed Chief Tidwell that while this informational discussion is useful, the ordinance does not permit the Commission to make a decision without proper notice. The Commission cannot give formal approval tonight, but it is not our intent to have the Fire Division repeat the same testimony at the Commission's next meeting. Chairman Michelson asked the Fire Division to submit a Certificate of

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
SEPTEMBER 27, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

Appropriateness application with the Planning Division, fulfill the notice requirement, and have at least one representative at the October meeting.

Chairman Michelson opened the hearing to the public for comment. Brian Munroe of 313 Franklin Place asked the Fire Division to look into a barn-style door that may match the building more than the proposed replacement doors. Lt. Reed said they have looked into various designs and they are astronomically expensive. Chairman Michelson closed the hearing to the public.

Mr. Thomas said the symmetry is bothering him and asked Chief Tidwell to look into investigating whether the Fire Division can install a custom door with faux characteristics, to make the width look the same as the opposite opening. Mr. Thomas added that the building is painfully symmetrical; it is recognized that the asymmetrical proposal is for practical reasons, but he asked the Fire Division to investigate alternatives.

2. Carried Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-01
334 Franklin Place. Block 642, Lot 26. Crescent Area Historic District
Jaime De La Cruz- Applicant & Owner

The Commission carried the application from the June 28, 2016, meeting. Mr. De La Cruz of 334 Franklin Place introduced himself and informed the Commission that he replaced three vinyl windows but now wishes to install wood replacement windows. The replacement windows are Andersen 400 Series "Woodright" 6 over 1, double hung. Two windows are on the second floor west façade and one is on the second floor south façade. Mr. Ross commented to the Commission that the proposed windows have interior grilles, which is not acceptable- the windows have to have simulated divided lites on both sides. The Commission and the applicant discussed the number of lites on the windows that were removed and the applicant agreed to change the configuration from 6 over 1 to 12 over 1.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public. Brian Munroe of 313 Franklin Place said the applicant removed a total of 5 windows- 4 in the front and one on the side. Mr. De La Cruz said he did not replace those windows; Mr. Munroe said he saw the house when it was for sale, and the original windows were still in place at that time. Chairman Michelson said only the three windows in question are the subject of tonight's meeting. Chairman Michelson closed the hearing to the public.

Vice Chairman Quirk made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace three windows on the second floor- two windows on the second floor west façade and one on the second floor south façade; the replacement windows will be 12 over 1 wood windows, 400 Series Woodright Andersen with simulated divided lites (outside and inside). Ms. King seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

John Favazzo (YES)	Bill Garrett (YES)	Sandy Gurshman (YES)	Jan Jasper (ABSENT)
Elizabeth King (YES)	William Michelson (YES)	Lawrence Quirk (YES)	Gary Schneider (YES)
Reginald Thomas (YES)			

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
SEPTEMBER 27, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

3. Carried Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-08

1423 Watchung Avenue. Block 630, Lot 6. Broadway Historic District

Diane Barnett - Applicant & Owner

HPC Secretary Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the applicant contacted him and informed him that she was not ready to proceed and asked to carry the application to the October meeting. Ms. Gurshman made a motion to carry the application to October 25, 2016; Mr. Garrett seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

4. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-09

922 Putnam Avenue. Block 642, Lot 3. Putnam Watchung Historic District

Steven Agudelo - Applicant & Property Owner

Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the applicant told him that he did not perform the public notice requirement and asked that the Commission re-schedule his application for the October meeting.

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-10

205 West Ninth Street. Block 758, Lot 34. Van Wyck Brooks Historic District

Michelle Antwi- Applicant & Property Owner

Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the public hearing notices are adequate and the Commission has jurisdiction to hear the application. Ms. Antwi of 205 West Ninth Street introduced herself to the Commission and informed them that she proposes to replace existing wood cedar shake roof with Cambridge IKO "Dual Brown" asphalt shingles with associated chimney flashing and EPDM to be laid at the flat roof section. Ms. Antwi also proposes to install wood lattice under the porch.

Ms. Gurshman asked Ms. Antwi if there was lattice when she bought the house; Ms. Antwi said there was no lattice under the porch when she bought it and she installed temporary lattice to keep rodents out. Vice Chairman Quirk asked what kind of lattice design is being proposed; Mr. Ross said the lattice should have a wood grid and the grid should be oriented vertically/horizontally not angled.

Chairman Michelson opened the meeting to the public. Brian Munroe of 313 Franklin Place suggested the applicant utilize vinyl for the bottom of the lattice due to rot and moisture concerns. Chairman Michelson closed the hearing to the public.

Vice Chairman Quirk made a motion to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to (1) replace the cedar shake roof with asphalt roof shingles (Cambridge IKO Dual Brown) with associated chimney flashing and EPDM to be laid at the flat roof section (gutter straps shall be installed underneath any new shingles- never over the top); and (2) install wood lattice under the porch to be framed by 1x painted wood trim with the wood grid oriented vertically / horizontally not angled with the lattice painted the same color as the front steps. Ms. Gurshman seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

John Favazzo (YES)

Bill Garrett (YES)

Sandy Gurshman (YES)

Jan Jasper (ABSENT)

Elizabeth King (YES)

William Michelson (YES)

Lawrence Quirk (YES)

Gary Schneider (YES)

Reginald Thomas (YES)

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
SEPTEMBER 27, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

6. Certificate of Appropriateness Application HPC 2016-11

443 Stelle Avenue. Block 755, Lot 1.01. Van Wyck Brooks Historic District

Joseph DeMeyer- Applicant & Property Owner

Mr. Bauman informed the Commission that the applicant told him that he did not perform the public notice requirement and asked that the Commission re-schedule his application for the October meeting.

7. Discussion: 1347 Watchung Avenue. Block 630, Lot 10. Broadway Historic District

Allison Bradshaw and Michael Liebhaber of 1347 Watchung Avenue introduced themselves as owners of 1347 Watchung Avenue. Ms. Bradshaw informed the Commission that there is a detached dilapidated garage on the property and they wish to demolish the structure and build a new detached garage in a style and with materials that will match the house. The Commission and Ms. Bradshaw discussed adding a dormer to the structure, and whether the structure will have one large door or two smaller doors. After further discussion, the property owners felt they had enough guidance in order to prepare plans and submit a formal application for demolition permit and Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Bradshaw and Mr. Liebhaber thanked the Commission for their time.

8. Discussion: 215 East Ninth Street. Block 829, Lot 10. Crescent Area Historic District

Brian Munroe of 313 Franklin Place introduced himself as the owner of 215 East Ninth Street. Mr. Munroe is proposing to convert the multi-family structure back to a one-family and to perform major renovation and repairs to the structure. Mr. Munroe listed the work being proposed, which includes widening and extending porch steps; adding a round window to the silo roof; repairing latticework, reproducing decorative details; removing side porch stairs; relocating bluestone walkways throughout the property; rearranging second floor windows on the rear elevation; opening up the back porch and installing new steps and railing; removing a later addition balcony; removing a fire escape; rebuilding three chimneys; and installing a rear yard privacy fence. After a brief discussion between Mr. Munroe and the Commission about the proposed projects, Mr. Munroe thanked the Commission for their time.

9. Discussion: Cedar Brook Park. Block 732, Lot 1. State & National Registered Landmark

The Commission discussed a draft letter in response to the September 9, 2016, letter from the Office of the Assistant Commissioner of the NJ Department of Environmental Protection to the County of Union authorizing alterations to Cedar Brook Park with conditions. The Commission discussed making the letter shorter, and rearranging certain paragraphs. Planning Board Chairman Ron Scott Bey was in the audience and Chairman Michelson asked him to comment. Mr. Scott Bey said if the county accepts the conditions cited in the matter, he feels that at some point in time they will begin construction and they should return to review plans through the Planning office. Chairman Michelson thanked Mr. Scott Bey for his comments. After further discussion, Chairman Michelson said he would revise the letter with the intention of it being distributed within one week.

10. Annual Membership Renewal: National Alliance of Preservation Commissions

Ms. King made a motion to approve the expenditure of \$100.00 for membership to the National Alliance of Preservation Commissions, 208 E. Plume Street, Suite 327, Norfolk, VA 23510. Vice Chairman Quirk seconded the motion and it was approved unanimously by voice vote.

MEETING MINUTES- PLAINFIELD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
SEPTEMBER 27, 2016, 7:30 PM, CITY HALL 1ST FLOOR LIBRARY, 515 WATCHUNG AVENUE, PLAINFIELD, NJ

New Business (continued)

John Favazzo (YES)	Bill Garrett (YES)	Sandy Gurshman (YES)	Jan Jasper (ABSENT)
Elizabeth King (YES)	William Michelson (YES)	Lawrence Quirk (YES)	Gary Schneider (YES)
Reginald Thomas (YES)			

Discussion

1. Historic Preservation Survey for District Expansions

Chairman Michelson informed the Commission that he was told by the State Historic Preservation Office that they received the paperwork from the National Park Service and that SHPO will soon meet with each municipality to discuss the details involved with grant management.

2. Tri-County History Fair: October 22, 2016

Commission members discussed who will work each shift, and the reference materials / handouts that are needed. Mr. Bauman said he will work with Mr. Favazzo on the reference materials and maps.

Reports

- 1. Community Outreach Committee:** Commission members expressed an interest in a 2016 Preservation Award program similar to the one held last year; Chairman Michelson asked Mr. Bauman to include this item in the October meeting agenda.
- 2. Ordinance Review Committee:** Mr. Bauman reported that the Planning Board is drafting revisions to the land use ordinance addressing signage, satellite dishes, and houses of worship. Chairman Michelson and Vice Chairman Quirk will continue to review and propose updates to the land use ordinance addressing historic preservation. Chairman Michelson mentioned a desire to remove the appeal provision of Historic Preservation decisions from the Zoning Board to the Superior Court, and to address solar panels in historic districts.
- 3. Architectural Review:** Mr. Bauman directed the attention of the Commission to their meeting packets where letters approving work not requiring a Certificate of Appropriateness are attached.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Ms. King made a motion for adjournment, seconded by Mr. Schneider; all voted in favor, none opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:22 PM

Respectfully submitted,

Scott Bauman

Scott Bauman, AICP, PP
Principal Planner / HPC Secretary, Plainfield Planning Division
Prepared: October 14, 2016

Approved by the Historic Preservation Commission: October 25, 2016